

**MINUTES**  
Baltimore City Civilian Review Board  
**REGULAR MEETING**  
December 21, 2023  
Place: Enabled by Zoom  
5:00-7:00 pm

**I. Welcome & call to order 5:05**

- Natalie Novak, Chair, Northern District
- Levi Zaslow, Northwestern District
- Amy Cruice, ACLU
- Megan Mishou
- Robin Drummond
- Shannon Harris, Community Member
- Jay Jimenez, ACLU

**II. Review and approval of agenda**

- Chair Novak moved to approve the December 21, 2023 Agenda, seconded by Levi Zaslow.
- Agenda was approved without objection.

**III. Review and approval of minutes**

- November 2023-Approved
  - Chair Novak called for a motion to approve the minutes.
  - Levi Zaslow moved to approve the November 29, 2023 minutes, seconded by Chair Novak. Minutes were approved without objection.

**IV. Director's Report-Megan Mishou**

- 4 - collaborative meetings, forums or presentations with CRB and the community in November – Total 42 in 2023
- 2 – Completed investigations. – Total 16 in 2023
- 0 - investigations that had recommendations that are punitive or non-punitive in November – Total 13 for 2023
- And there's one pending this month to get the discipline. That's why there's a difference in case numbers.
- 1 - cases officially closed by the board in November – Total 13 for 2023
- 0 – cases with sustained allegations in November – Total 4 for 2023.
- 0 – CRB intakes for November – Total 43 intakes for 2023.
- 11 – notifications from Internal Affairs Divisions in November – Total 179 notifications for 2023.
- 1- new complaints sent to the Board – Total 13 for 2023
- 0 – Board authorized investigations for November – Total – 10 for 2023
- 1- Number of complaints referred to Internal Affairs only – Total one for 2023
- Megan Mishou gave an update about the new Deputy Chief for PAB, Aeiramique Glass, and that the transition is going smoothly.
- Amy Cruice asked when the Annual Report will be done to compare the numbers with previous years. In response Megan Mishou referred the question to the Chair. Natalie said that OECR prepares is at the end the year for CRB review. Ms. Mishou will follow-up with Tiffany Jones.

**MINUTES**  
Baltimore City Civilian Review Board  
**REGULAR MEETING**  
December 21, 2023  
Place: Enabled by Zoom  
5:00-7:00 pm

- Chair Novak would like an update on the new members as well. Ms. Mishou does not have an update but will follow-up.
- Chair Novak reminded everyone that Mariel Shutinya is no longer with the Office of Equity and Civil Rights.

**V. New Complaints:**

- **No New Complaints**

**VI. Completed Cases:**

**A. CRB2023-0006/PIB2023-0086:** Filed on January 25, 2023, against an identified officer on behalf of herself and her son, for harassment, excessive force, false imprisonment and false arrest. The Complainant stated that on January 22, 2023, she received a call from a family member that BPD officers were entering her vehicle because it was parked illegally in a handicap spot. When the Complainant arrived at the scene, she stated that several officers were surrounding her vehicle and that her vehicle had been opened by the officers. When the Complainant asked the officers whether they had a warrant to enter the vehicle, the Complainant stated that the accused officer approached the Complainant and asked her to identify herself. The Complainant confirmed that she was the owner of the vehicle. However, she never received a response regarding why her vehicle was being entered by the officers. During the incident, the Complainant stated that the identified officer also requested that the Complainant identify her son. After identifying the Victim as her 18-year-old son, the Complainant stated that several officers grabbed the Victim and placed him in handcuffs stating that they needed to question him. To deescalate the situation and get the Victim to comply with the officers, the Complainant said that she “redirected the Victim’s face with her hand so that the Victim could make eye contact with her” and advised the Victim to stop being disrespectful towards the officers. Immediately after the Complainant touched the Victim’s face with her hand, she alleged that the officer pushed her in the chest, causing her to fall against her vehicle. Several minutes later, the Complainant stated that the officer placed handcuffs on the Complainant and stated that she was under arrest for assaulting the Victim. The Complainant stated that ultimately both herself and the Victim were uncuffed at the scene and released. The Complainant’s vehicle was towed and fined for parking illegally in a handicap spot.

- Chair Novak:
  - stated that she read the summary of the case.

**MINUTES**  
Baltimore City Civilian Review Board  
**REGULAR MEETING**  
December 21, 2023  
Place: Enabled by Zoom  
5:00-7:00 pm

- Chair Novak stated that the Board had discussed the case at length at the previous meeting and did more research and watched the video again.
    - Chair Novak stated that, “based on the policy, I do did not believe that there was sufficient evidence of Excessive Force, False Imprisonment, Harassment or False Arrest towards the victim.
    - For the Complainant, Chair Novak stated that “there was not any reason whatsoever to handcuff the complainant’, and the Officer ended up not arresting her.
    - She did find Sustained on Excessive Force and False Imprisonment.
    - Not sustained pending disciplinary record before Jan 2024
  - Levi Laslow:
    - stated that he agreed and watched the video to see how long it took to put the handcuffs on the complainant. He stated that the other Officer seemed to have de-escalated, she engages him, and then he ends up putting cuffs on her.
    - He agreed to sustain on False Imprisonment and Excessive Force.
  - Amy Cruice:
    - stated that “having not seen the video and may have lost context.” She asked other questions.
  - Chair Novak stated she did not really understand the Officer’s intent by putting the cuffs on her and then taking them off.
  - The Board voted to sustain the allegations of False Imprisonment and Excessive Force against the subject Officer of the complainant.
  - The Board voted to not sustain the allegations against the victim.
  - Chair Novak will email Ms. Mishou and Deputy Chief Glass for the disciplinary records. Depending on the date of the next meeting and the disciplinary record in January, she stated that the recommendation can be made before the expiration on January 24, 2024.
- B. CRB2023-0016/PIB2023-0057:** Filed on March 9, 2023, against identified BPD officers for harassment. The Complainant alleged that on January 8, 2023, he was working on his truck on his property when he saw someone illegally dumping on it. The Complainant stated that he took pictures of the individual and warned the individual to stop the dumping. The Complainant claimed that after he confronted the individual for illegal dumping, the individual stated, "It's my hood," and proceeded to argue with the Complainant. Subsequently, the Complainant threatened to contact law enforcement, and alleged that the individual physically assaulted him by smacking his phone out of his hand. In addition, the Complainant alleged that the individual attempted to run him over with a truck, which caused the Complainant to call the police. Upon the police arrival, The Complainant

**MINUTES**  
Baltimore City Civilian Review Board  
**REGULAR MEETING**  
December 21, 2023  
Place: Enabled by Zoom  
5:00-7:00 pm

alleged that the Officer drew his firearm, pointed it at the Complainant, and ordered him to drop the hammer that the Complainant had been holding in self-defense. The Complainant stated that he complied with the Officer's command and that the Officer later apologized for drawing his gun at the Complainant. The Complainant alleges harassment because he believes that the Officer's use of the firearm was unwarranted and put the Complainant's life at risk. Further, the Complainant believes that the Officer pointed the gun at him because he's Latino. The Complainant further noted that the Officer's conduct was unprofessional compared to the other officers' present at the scene.

- Chair Novak:
  - Chair Novak read the summary of the case.
  - The Chair stated: "So, we discussed this complaint last month and I did some research."
- Amy Cruice asked why we deferred it to watch the body worn camera again.
  - Chair Novak responded that she did not see anything uploaded.
- Levi Zaslow said that they did a supplemental file that was uploaded. He read the statement about the levels use of force that was placed in the file.
  - Chair Novak stated that this case is not expiring soon.
  - Members discussed the discrepancies on pointing a gun being a certain level use of force.
- Chair Novak did not find for excessive force and does not find evidence of excessive force.
- Levi Zaslow did not find evidence of harassment.
- The Board voted to not sustain in the allegations.
- Note: The Board wanted to make a note to take a closer look at keeping the individuals separated.

**C. CRB2022-0070/PIB22J-0004:** Filed on May 25, 2023, against identified BPD officers on behalf of her deceased son for excessive force. The Complainant stated that on February 19, 2022, her son was driving his car when he was stopped by BPD officers for an outstanding warrant. The Complainant stated that because her son was unarmed and feared for his life, he returned to his vehicle and attempted to flee the scene. As he attempted to flee, the Complainant stated that the officers shot her son in his chest. The Complainant is alleging excessive force because she believes that this was an unjust shooting. The Complainant also believes that BPD is attempting to dehumanize her son by stating that he had a criminal record and an outstanding warrant as a way to distract from their misconduct. After the medic arrived, the Complainant's son was taken to the hospital where he was pronounced dead.

**MINUTES**  
Baltimore City Civilian Review Board  
**REGULAR MEETING**  
December 21, 2023  
Place: Enabled by Zoom  
5:00-7:00 pm

- Chair Novak:
  - Chair Novak read the summary of the new case.
  - They were provided 3 BWC and 3 different videos.
  - This is a new complaint that was not heard last week
  - PIB find was first officer exonerated
  - Second Officer sustained for excessive force
  - This ended up being an open warrant for a carjacking
  - It has been investigated.
  - We will vote on it next month.
- Levi Zaslow:
  - Levi Zaslow noted needing more information and take a closer look at BPD policies
  - Chair Novak agreed
- Amy Cruice asked why the case was expiring in May.
  - Chair Novak responded that it happened in February and was filed in May.
- Jay Jimenez spoke on the case.
  - what stood out
  - what things to take into account
  - asked about witnesses.
- Megan Mishou:
  - noted in the chat that all CRB complaints must be on a CRB form
  - CRB complaints have to be on a signed CRB form.
  - PAB complaints do not require a signed form.
  - PAB receives every complaint involving a citizen
- Amy Cruice asked if CRB can get the disciplinary history of the officers.
  - Chair Novak will ask and requested a reminder to share with the Board.
  - Amy Cruice also asked, “why haven’t we received more of these excessive force complaints? We have fewer new complaints being filed.”
  - Chair Novak agreed that there should be an administrative meeting to discuss 1664 and start requesting all police involved shootings.
- Chair Novak mentioned a pattern of de-escalation policies. Jay Jimenez posted in the chat the De-Escalation Policy 1107.
- Levi Zaslow posted in the chat:
  - § 16-46. Board proceedings. (a) Board review of complaint. (1) The Board shall review all complaints alleging police misconduct described in § 16-42(a)(1) of this subheading. (2) The Board may investigate, simultaneously with the Internal Investigative Division, each complaint it deems appropriate and report its findings to the Internal Investigative Division.
  - The Board would like to talk to the Deputy Chief about the complaints that fit within the allegations of the statute next month.

**MINUTES**  
Baltimore City Civilian Review Board  
**REGULAR MEETING**  
December 21, 2023  
Place: Enabled by Zoom  
5:00-7:00 pm

- The Board would like to know the status of the new members.
  - Amy Cruice will look up the City Council Minutes.
- Amy Cruice asked if the CRB investigator can interview the AG's investigator.
  - Chair Novak will email Tiffany Jones about whether our investigator can get information contact in the care.
  - She suggested to ask the AG's officer or PIB to come to the meeting and talk about this case.
  - Chair Novak also suggested talking to Sgt Batey.
  - She welcomed comments and questions.

**VII. Public Comment**

- No comment

**VIII. Old Business**

- No old business

**IX. New Business**

- No new business

**X. Adjournment**

- Chair Novak ended the meeting at 6:31pm.